Space-times admitting the complete set of the gauge conditions for higher spin fields

This article has been downloaded from IOPscience. Please scroll down to see the full text article.
1982 J. Phys. A: Math. Gen. 153525
(http://iopscience.iop.org/0305-4470/15/11/028)
View the table of contents for this issue, or go to the journal homepage for more

Download details:
IP Address: 129.252.86.83
The article was downloaded on 30/05/2010 at 15:02

Please note that terms and conditions apply.

# Space-times admitting the complete set of the gauge conditions for higher spin fields 

L P Grishchuk $\dagger$ and A D Popova $\ddagger$<br>$\dagger$ Shternberg Astronomical Institute, Moscow 117234, USSR<br>$\ddagger$ Space Research Institute, Moscow 117810, USSR

Received 26 March 1982


#### Abstract

We have found and investigated the important class of Riemannian space-times. In these and only in these space-times one can impose the complete set of gauge conditions on massless fields of higher spins. This set reduces the number of independent field variables to two. By this means one can simplify the field equations and interpret the solutions to the equations properly. In this paper we consider curvature of these spacetimes, their Petrov classification and the uniqueness of the gauge vector field which is used for imposing the complete set of gauge conditions.


## 1. Introduction

It is known that in flat space-time the equations for the electromagnetic field (spin 1 ), the spinorial field of spin $\frac{3}{2}$ and the weak gravitational field (spin 2) admit the group of gauge transformations, which leave the equations invariant. The gauge transformations are usually used for imposing the auxiliary (gauge) conditions, which connect the different field variables and reduce the number of independent ones to two. These conditions are similar for all the fields and they imply that certain combinations of field variables $A_{\mu \nu} \ldots$ vanish. They are: the four-divergence $A^{\mu}{ }_{\nu \ldots ; \mu}=$ 0 , the trace $A_{\mu . . .}^{\mu}=0$ or the similar algebraic combination $\gamma^{\mu} A_{\mu \ldots .}=0$ in the spinorial case and the product of $A_{\mu \nu \ldots}$.. with some fixed vector field $u^{\mu}, A_{\mu \nu \ldots} u^{\nu}=0$. For example, the gauge conditions for electromagnetic potentials $A_{\mu}$ given in Minkowskian coordinates have the form

$$
A_{, \mu}^{\mu}=0, \quad A_{\mu} u^{\mu}=0
$$

One usually chooses the vector $u^{\mu}$ to be time-like and to have the components $u^{\mu}=(1,0,0,0)$, which means that $A_{0}=0$. In general the vector $u^{\mu}$ can be time-like, space-like or null, so we will not restrict ourselves by the time-like $u^{\mu}$. In what follows we call $u^{\mu}$ the gauge vector and the mentioned set of gauge conditions a complete set.

The generally covariant equations for fields embedded in curved space-time describe the interaction of these fields with the external gravitational field. These equations for the fields mentioned above possess the group of gauge transformations.

In a curved space-time it is natural to adopt the gauge conditions which are the generally covariant version of the conditions adopted in flat space-time. However, it turns out that in arbitrary curved space-time one cannot use the gauge freedom for imposing the complete set of gauge conditions (Grishchuk and Popova 1981). They may be satisfied jointly only in some limited class of space-times.

The necessary and sufficient condition for this is the existence of the vector field $u^{\mu}$ which obeys the equations (Grishchuk and Popova 1981)

$$
\begin{align*}
& u_{\mu ; \nu}=u_{\mu} a_{\nu}+b g_{\mu \nu}  \tag{1}\\
& b_{, \mu}-b a_{\mu}=c u_{\mu} \tag{2}
\end{align*}
$$

where $a_{\mu}$ is an arbitrary vector $b$ and $c$ are arbitrary scalars. In some cases equation (1) exhausts all the restrictions on a space-time metric, so we shall first consider those space-times which admit the vector field (1), and later we shall take into account the additional restriction (2).

Let us start by indicating some properties of the vector field $u^{\mu}$. According to equation (1) $u_{\mu: \nu} u^{\nu}$ is proportional to $u_{\mu}$, which means that the vector field $u_{\mu}$ defines the geodesic congruence. Further, from the same equation it follows that

$$
u_{\lambda} u_{[\mu ; \nu]}+u_{\mu} u_{[\nu ; \lambda]}+u_{\nu} u_{[\lambda ; \mu]}=0
$$

hence, the vector field $u^{\mu}$ differs from a gradient vector field at most by a scalar factor (Petrov 1969).

Let us introduce the norm of $u^{\mu}: u_{\mu} u^{\mu}= \pm \rho^{2}$. By differentiating this equality and by taking into account equation (1) one obtains

$$
\rho_{, \nu}^{2}=2 \rho^{2} a_{\nu} \pm 2 b u_{\nu}
$$

which leads to $b=0$ if $\rho=0$ and

$$
a_{\nu}=(\ln \rho)_{, \nu} \mp b u_{\nu}
$$

if $\rho \neq 0$. It is convenient to carry out the subsequent investigation of equations (1) and (2) separately for two cases: for null $u_{\mu}\left(u_{\mu} u^{\mu}=0\right)$ and non-null $u_{\mu}\left(u_{\mu} u^{\mu} \neq 0\right)$.

## 2. Non-null gauge vector

For the vector $v^{\mu}$ with unit norm

$$
v_{\mu}=(1 / \rho) u_{\mu}, \quad v_{\mu} v^{\mu} \equiv \chi= \pm 1
$$

equation (1) takes the form

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{\mu ; \nu}=p\left[g_{\mu \nu}-(1 / x) v_{\mu} v_{\nu}\right] \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $p=b / \rho$ is an arbitrary scalar. Equation (2) gives the additional restriction

$$
\begin{equation*}
p_{, \mu}=(1 / x)\left(p_{, \alpha} v^{\alpha}\right) v_{\mu} \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

First, let us show that the non-null vector field (3) may only exist either in flat space-time or in a Ricci non-flat space-time ( $R_{\mu \nu} \neq 0$ ). The integrability conditions for equations (3) have the form

$$
\begin{gather*}
v^{\beta} R_{\beta \mu \nu \alpha}=\left(p^{2} / x\right)\left(g_{\mu \nu} v_{\alpha}-g_{\mu \alpha} v_{\nu}\right)+p_{, \alpha}\left[g_{\mu \nu}-(1 / x) v_{\mu} v_{\nu}\right] \\
-p_{, \nu}\left[g_{\mu \alpha}-(1 / x) v_{\mu} v_{\alpha}\right] \tag{5}
\end{gather*}
$$

which yields

$$
\begin{equation*}
v^{\beta} R_{\alpha \beta}=-2 p_{, \alpha}-(1 / x) v_{\alpha}\left(p_{, \beta} v^{\beta}+3 p^{2}\right) \tag{6}
\end{equation*}
$$

In a vacuum space-time $\left(R_{\alpha \beta}=0\right)$ equation (6) would give

$$
p_{, \alpha}=-(1 / x) p^{2} v_{\alpha}
$$

which would result in the relation $v^{\beta} R_{\beta \mu \nu \alpha}=0$. It is known (Zakharov 1972) that if this relation holds along with $R_{\alpha \beta}=0$, then $\left(v_{\lambda} v^{\lambda}\right) R_{\beta \mu \nu \alpha}=0$ and hence the space-time must be flat since the vector $v_{\alpha}$ is non-null.

Let us consider the Riemann and Ricci tensors of space-time admitting a gradient vector field (such as the vector field (3), $v_{\mu ; \nu}-v_{\nu ; \mu}=0$ ). These tensors can be written down in covariant form as follows.

Introduce the metric tensor $\gamma_{\alpha \beta}$ of the three-dimensional sections orthogonal to the congruence $v_{\alpha}$ :

$$
\gamma_{\alpha \beta}=g_{\alpha \beta}-(1 / \chi) v_{\alpha} v_{\beta} .
$$

The tensor $\gamma_{\alpha}^{\beta}=\delta_{\alpha}^{\beta}-(1 / x) v_{\alpha} v^{\beta}$ plays the role of a projection operator. By multiplying an object with the projection operator one can distinguish the components of the object which are orthogonal to $v_{\alpha}$. We shall denote the quantities belonging to the orthogonal sections by script letters. Then for the Cristoffel symbols and for the Riemann tensor one has respectively

$$
\begin{align*}
& \gamma_{\rho}^{\alpha} \gamma_{\beta}^{\sigma} \gamma_{\gamma}^{\tau} \Gamma_{\sigma \tau}^{\rho}=\mathscr{T}_{\beta \gamma}^{\alpha},  \tag{7}\\
& \gamma_{\alpha}^{\mu} \gamma_{\beta}^{\nu} \gamma_{\gamma}^{\lambda} \gamma_{\delta}^{\rho} R_{\mu \nu \lambda \rho}=\mathscr{R}_{\alpha \beta \gamma \delta}+(1 / \chi) \gamma_{\alpha}^{\mu} \gamma_{\beta}^{\nu} \gamma_{\gamma}^{\lambda} \gamma_{\delta}^{\rho}\left(v_{\mu ; \rho} v_{\nu ; \lambda}-v_{\mu ; \lambda} v_{\nu ; \rho}\right) \tag{8}
\end{align*}
$$

(For the gradient vector $v_{\alpha}$ equation (8) establishes a particular case of the general relation derived in Zel'manov (1976).)

If equation (4) is satisfied together with equation (3), then one can introduce the vector field $w_{\alpha}$ which differs from $v_{\alpha}$ by a scalar factor and such that equations (3) and (4) take the form

$$
\begin{equation*}
w_{\mu ; \nu}=q g_{\mu \nu}, \quad q_{, \alpha}=(1 / \varepsilon)\left(q_{, \mu} w^{\mu}\right) w_{\alpha} \equiv d w_{\alpha} \tag{9}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $w_{\alpha} w^{\alpha}=\varepsilon$ and $d$ is a scalar. A space-time which admits the vector field $w_{\alpha}$ restricted by equation (9) is called equidistant (Sinukov 1979). For these space-times the relation (8) takes the form

$$
\begin{align*}
R_{\mu \nu \rho \sigma}=\mathscr{R}_{\mu \nu \rho \sigma} & +(d / \varepsilon)\left(g_{\nu \rho} w_{\mu} w_{\sigma}-g_{\nu \sigma} w_{\mu} w_{\rho}\right. \\
& \left.+g_{\mu \sigma} w_{\nu} w_{\rho}-g_{\mu \rho} w_{\nu} w_{\sigma}\right)+\left(q^{2} / \varepsilon\right)\left(\gamma_{\nu \rho} \gamma_{\mu \sigma}-\gamma_{\mu \rho} \gamma_{\nu \sigma}\right) \tag{10}
\end{align*}
$$

where equation (9) has been used. From equation (10) it follows that

$$
\begin{equation*}
R_{\mu \nu}=\mathscr{R}_{\mu \nu}-d\left(g_{\mu \nu}+\frac{2}{\varepsilon} w_{\mu} w_{\nu}\right)-\frac{2 q^{2}}{\varepsilon}\left(g_{\mu \nu}-\frac{1}{\varepsilon} w_{\mu} w_{\nu}\right) \tag{11}
\end{equation*}
$$

The tensors $\mathscr{R}_{\mu \nu \lambda \rho}$ and $\mathscr{R}_{\mu \nu}$ determine the geometry of sections orthogonal to $w_{\alpha}$ and they are unrestricted.

Equation (11) gives certain limitations on the general structure of the energymomentum tensor, which could govern the equidistant space-time according to the Einstein equations.

Let us give the Petrov classification of the equidistant space-times. It can be given fairly completely even without using the exact form of the metric tensor. Multiply
equation (10) and equation (11) by $w^{\mu}$. One gets respectively

$$
\begin{align*}
& w^{\mu} R_{\mu \nu \rho \sigma}=d\left(g_{\nu \rho} w_{\sigma}-g_{\nu \sigma} w_{\rho}\right),  \tag{12}\\
& w^{\mu} R_{\mu \nu}=-3 d w_{\nu} . \tag{13}
\end{align*}
$$

(Equation (12) can also be derived as the integrability condition for equation (9).) By using the expression for the Weyl tensor and taking into account equations (12), (13), one finds

$$
\begin{equation*}
w^{\mu} C_{\mu \nu \rho \sigma}=\frac{1}{2}\left(w_{\sigma} R_{\nu \rho}-w_{\rho} R_{\nu \sigma}\right)-\frac{1}{2}\left(d+\frac{1}{3} R\right)\left(w_{\sigma} g_{\nu \rho}-w_{\rho} g_{\nu \sigma}\right) . \tag{14}
\end{equation*}
$$

It is important to notice that if the vector $\xi_{\alpha}$ is an eigenvector of the Ricci tensor $\dagger$ $\xi^{\beta} R_{\alpha \beta}=\lambda \xi_{\alpha}$, then the simple bivector $W^{\alpha \beta}=w^{\alpha} \xi^{\beta}-w^{\beta} \xi^{\alpha}$ is an eigen-bivector of the Weyl tensor. Indeed, equation (14) yields

$$
\begin{equation*}
W^{\mu \nu} C_{\mu \nu \rho \sigma}=\Lambda W_{\rho \sigma}, \quad \Lambda=d+\frac{1}{3} R-\lambda \tag{15}
\end{equation*}
$$

According to equation (13), one of the eigenvectors of $R_{\mu \nu}$, and moreover the real one, is $w^{\mu}$.

Let $w^{\mu}$ be a time-like vector. Then the other eigenvectors, orthogonal to $w^{\mu}$, must be space-like and also real (see, for example, Landau and Lifshitz 1971). Since the tensor $\mathscr{R}_{\mu \nu}$ is arbitrary it has, in general, three different space-like eigenvectors.

Denote them by $\stackrel{(a)}{\xi}{ }^{\alpha}(a=1,2,3)$. Then ${\stackrel{(a)}{W}{ }_{\alpha}}^{\beta}$ are simple and real eigen-bivectors of the Weyl tensor. Moreover, the eigenvalues ${ }_{(a)}^{(a)}$ satisfy equation $\Sigma_{a=1}^{3}{ }_{(a)}^{(a)}=0$, which follows from equation (15) and from the fact that for the non-null eigenvectors of $R_{\mu \nu}$ the following equality holds: $R=\Sigma_{a=1}^{3} \stackrel{(a)}{\lambda}+\stackrel{(0)}{\lambda}$ where $\stackrel{(0)}{\lambda}=-3 d$. Thus, in the general case we have three different real eigen-bivectors of the Weyl tensor, which means that the metric belongs to type I with the real eigenvalues. If two or three eigenvalues $\stackrel{(a)}{\Lambda}$ coincide, then the type of the space-time reduces to type $D$ or type O. The latter case takes place if the Ricci tensor simplifies to the form

$$
R_{\mu \nu}=\alpha w_{\mu} w_{\nu}+\beta g_{\mu \nu}
$$

If $w^{\mu}$ is a space-like vector then the eigenvectors of the Ricci tensor can be real, complex or null. This means that the eigen-bivectors of the Weyl tensor can be complex conjugate or null. According to this, among the equidistant space-times appear representatives of types II, N and III.

Now let us consider the problem of uniqueness of the gauge vector $w_{\mu}$. First, we shall show that there exists only one gauge vector $w_{\mu}$ if $d \neq$ constant. Suppose that there are two different (non-collinear) vectors $w^{\mu}$ and $\bar{w}^{\mu}, \bar{w}^{\mu} \neq \alpha w^{\mu}$. For $\bar{w}^{\mu}$, as well as for $w^{\mu}$, equation (9) is valid and the equation similar to equation (12) should also be satisfied:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\bar{w}^{\mu} R_{\mu \nu \rho \sigma}=\bar{d}\left(g_{\nu \rho} \bar{w}_{\sigma}-g_{\nu \sigma} \bar{w}_{\rho}\right) . \tag{16}
\end{equation*}
$$

Multiplying equation (16) by $w^{\mu}$ and multiplying equation (12) by $\bar{w}^{\mu}$ and then adding one to another, one gets the relation $d=\bar{d}$. It now follows from the relation $q_{, \alpha \beta}-q_{, \beta \alpha}=0=\bar{q},_{\alpha \beta}-\bar{q}_{, \beta \alpha}$ that either $\bar{w}^{\mu}$ is proportional to $w^{\mu}$, which contradicts the initial suggestion, or $d=$ constant.

In the case $d=$ constant the number of different gauge vectors can be larger than one (this is obvious if $d=0$ ).

[^0]
## 3. Null gauge vector

Since in this case $b=0$, the equality (2) gives $c=0$ and does not bring any new restrictions on the gauge vector. The only restriction is equation (1). Introduce $v_{\mu}=(\exp \alpha) e_{\mu}$ where $e_{[\mu ; \nu]}=0$. By alternating indices $\mu$ and $\nu$ in equation (1) one sees that $a_{\mu}-\alpha_{, \mu}$ is proportional to $u_{\mu}$. This allows one to rewrite equation (1) in the form

$$
\begin{equation*}
e_{\mu: \nu}=m e_{\mu} e_{\nu}, \tag{17}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $m$ is an arbitrary scalar. The integrability conditions for equation (17) are

$$
\begin{equation*}
e^{\mu} R_{, \mu \nu \alpha \beta}=e_{\nu}\left(m_{, \alpha} e_{\beta}-m_{, \beta} e_{\alpha}\right) . \tag{18}
\end{equation*}
$$

Equation (18) leads to

$$
e^{\mu} \boldsymbol{R}_{\mu \nu}=\left(m_{, \alpha} e^{\alpha}\right) e_{\nu}
$$

so that the vector $e^{\mu}$ is an eigenvector of the Ricci tensor.
In order to write down the formulae for the Riemann and Ricci tensors of a space-time subjected to equation (17), we will need the relation between the Riemann tensor of the space-time and the Riemann tensor of the two-dimensional space $V_{2}$ orthogonal to the two given geodesic congruences. Let $n^{\mu}$ and $t^{\mu}$ be time-like and space-like gradient vectors, respectively. We choose them to be orthogonal and have unit norms:

$$
n_{\mu} t^{\mu}=0, \quad n_{\mu} n^{\mu}=1, \quad t_{\mu} t^{\mu}=-1
$$

Applying equations (7) and (8) twice, one obtains
$\gamma_{\alpha}^{\prime \mu} \gamma_{\beta}^{\prime \nu} \gamma_{\gamma}^{\prime \lambda} \gamma_{\delta}^{\prime \rho} R_{\mu \nu \lambda \rho}=\mathscr{R}_{\alpha \beta \gamma \delta}^{\prime}+\gamma_{\alpha}^{\prime \mu} \gamma_{\beta}^{\prime \nu} \gamma_{\gamma}^{\prime \lambda} \gamma_{\delta}^{\prime \rho}\left(t_{\nu ; \lambda} t_{\mu ; \rho}-t_{\mu ; \lambda} t_{\nu ; \rho}-n_{\nu ; \lambda} n_{\mu ; \rho}+n_{\mu ; \lambda} n_{\nu ; \rho}\right)$,
where

$$
\gamma_{\beta}^{\prime \alpha}=\delta_{\beta}^{\alpha}-n^{\alpha} n_{\beta}+t^{\alpha} t_{\beta},
$$

and $\mathscr{R}_{\alpha \beta \gamma \delta}^{\prime}$ is the Riemann tensor of the two-dimensional space. For every $V_{2}$ the following relation is valid:

$$
\mathscr{R}_{\alpha \beta \gamma \delta}^{\prime}=\mathscr{K}\left(\gamma_{\alpha \gamma}^{\prime} \gamma_{\beta \delta}^{\prime}-\gamma_{\alpha \delta}^{\prime} \gamma_{\beta \gamma}^{\prime}\right) .
$$

Now introduce $e^{\mu}$ and $\bar{e}^{\mu}$ as follows:

$$
e^{\mu}=(1 / \sqrt{2})\left(n^{\mu}+t^{\mu}\right), \quad \bar{e}^{\mu}=(1 / \sqrt{2})\left(n^{\mu}-t^{\mu}\right)
$$

Let the null vector $e^{\mu}$ satisfy equation (17). Then from equation (19) one obtains

$$
\begin{gathered}
R_{\mu \nu \lambda \rho}=\mathscr{K}\left(\gamma_{\mu \lambda}^{\prime} \gamma_{\nu \rho}^{\prime}-\gamma_{\mu \rho}^{\prime} \gamma_{\nu \lambda}^{\prime}\right)+\bar{e}^{\alpha}\left(e_{\mu} R_{\alpha \nu \lambda \rho}-e_{\nu} R_{\alpha \mu \lambda \rho}+e_{\lambda} R_{\alpha \rho \mu \nu}-e_{\rho} R_{\alpha \lambda \mu \nu}\right) \\
-\bar{e}^{\alpha} \bar{e}^{\beta}\left(e_{\mu} e_{\rho} R_{\alpha \nu \beta \lambda}-e_{\mu} e_{\lambda} R_{\alpha \nu \beta \rho}+e_{\nu} e_{\lambda} R_{\alpha \mu \beta \rho}-e_{\nu} e_{\rho} R_{\alpha \mu \beta \lambda}\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

As a consequence of this equation one has

$$
\begin{equation*}
R_{\mu \nu}=e_{\mu} A_{\nu}+e_{\nu} A_{\mu}+\mathscr{K} g_{\mu \nu} \tag{20}
\end{equation*}
$$

where

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A_{\mu}=R_{\mu \nu} \bar{e}^{\nu}-\frac{1}{2} e_{\mu} R_{\alpha \beta} \bar{e}^{\alpha} \bar{e}^{\beta}-\mathscr{K} \bar{e}_{\mu}, \\
& \mathscr{K}=\left(A_{\nu}-m_{, \nu}\right) e^{\nu} .
\end{aligned}
$$

Equation (20) determines the structure of the energy-momentum tensor which can govern the dynamics of space-time.

Let us give the Petrov classification of the space-time under consideration. By using equations (18) and (20) one gets

$$
\begin{gather*}
e^{\alpha} C_{\alpha \beta \gamma \delta}=e_{\beta}\left[e_{\gamma}\left(m_{, \delta}-\frac{1}{2} A_{\delta}\right)-e_{\delta}\left(m_{, \gamma}-\frac{1}{2} A_{\gamma}\right)\right]+\frac{1}{3}\left(e_{\delta} g_{\beta \gamma}-e_{\gamma} g_{\beta \delta}\right)\left(m_{, \alpha}-A_{\alpha}\right) e^{\alpha}, \\
e^{\alpha} e^{\gamma} C_{\alpha \beta \gamma \delta}=\frac{1}{3} e_{\beta} e_{\delta} e^{\alpha}\left(A_{\alpha}-2 m_{, \alpha}\right)=-\frac{1}{6} R e_{\beta} e_{\delta},  \tag{21}\\
e^{\alpha} e^{\gamma} C_{\alpha \beta \gamma[\delta} e_{\lambda]}=0 .
\end{gather*}
$$

It follows from equation (21) that the space-time cannot belong to type I. A further corollary is that if $R \neq 0$ the space-time must belong to type II or type D. It follows from equation (21) that the eigenvalues $(\alpha+\mathrm{i} \beta)_{1,2,3}$ in cases II and D look like

$$
\alpha_{1}=-\frac{1}{6} R, \quad \alpha_{2}=\alpha_{3}=\frac{1}{12} R, \quad \beta_{1}=\beta_{2}=\beta_{3}=0,
$$

when $R=0$, and as a special case in vacuum space-times $\left(R_{\mu \nu}=0\right)$ the Weyl tensor can be of types III, N and O only. (It should be emphasised that the covariantly constant vector field $e_{\alpha}$ may exist only in space-times of types N and O .)

Now let us turn to the problem of the uniqueness of the gauge vector $e_{\alpha}$. It is seen from equation (21) that $e_{\alpha}$ is the degenerate null eigenvector of the Weyl tensor. Because of that the vector $e_{\alpha}$ is unique except, may be, for the space-times of type D where there exist two degenerate null vectors and type O where there exist many gauge vectors.

## References

Grishchuk L P and Popova A D 1981 Zh. Eksp. Teor. Fiz. 80 3-18 (1981 Sov. Phys.-JETP 53 1)
Landau L D and Lifshitz E M 1971 The Classical Theory of Fields 4th edn (Oxford: Pergamon) § 94
Petrov A Z 1969 Einstein Spaces (New York: Pergamon) \& 7
Sinukov N S 1979 Geodesical Mapping of Riemannian Spaces (Moscow: Nauka) (in Russian) p 83 Zakharov V D 1972 Gravitational Waves in Einstein Theory (Moscow: Nauka) (in Russian) p 179
Zel'manov A L 1976 Dokl. Akad. Nauk 227 N1, 78-81 (in Russian)


[^0]:    $\dagger$ Remember that $R_{\alpha \beta} \neq 0$ except for the trivial case $R_{\mu \nu \alpha \beta}=0$.

